Chemicals in food contact materials (FCM) - it’s a mess

Dr A. Michael Warhurst
Executive Director, CHEM Trust
Food Packaging Forum Seminar
13th March 2017
Contents

• Introduction to CHEM Trust
• EU regulation of chemicals in food contact materials
• Pizza boxes full of surprises
• Some holes in, and problems with, the current EU regulations
• Signs of action…
• What do we want?
• Conclusions
About CHEM Trust

• A charity working mainly at EU level to protect humans & wildlife from harmful chemicals
• Working with scientists, technical processes and decision makers, in partnership with other civil society groups
• Focus on identification of, and action on, endocrine disrupting chemicals
• See our blog & twitter for more: www.chemtrust.org.uk
EU Regs on chemicals in FCM

• 2004 regulation “on materials and articles intended to come into contact with food” [1]
  – Created a general safety requirement:
    • “Materials and articles, … shall be manufactured in compliance with good manufacturing practice so that, under normal or foreseeable conditions of use, they do not transfer their constituents to food in quantities which could:
      (a) endanger human health;…”

• Provision for more detailed daughter legislation, including positive list of chemicals etc
  – In place for “plastic materials and articles intended to come into contact with food” (2011) [2]

• No EU harmonised regulations for paper, ink, coatings, adhesive & board (PICAB) food contact materials
Pizza boxes full of surprises

- Pizza boxes often made from recycled paper/card

- Problems from recycling:
  - Chemicals from ink, glue, paper, coatings in the recyclate can contaminate recycled materials
  - E.g. Pizza Boxes in Denmark found to contain Bisphenol A (from thermal paper?, Phthalates, Mineral Oils, Nonylphenol, Perfluorocarbons (PFCs) [4]

- May also be deliberate use of PFCs:
  - A wide range of PFCs have been deliberately added to paper & card packaging
  - They break down into persistent pollutants, many known to be toxic [5]
A system full of holes

• There is a positive ‘Union list’ of chemicals used in plastic FCM, risk assessed by EFSA
  – There is no EU level list of safety assessed chemicals for PICAB materials [nor in almost all Member States]

• Processes to recycle plastic in new FCMs (e.g. bottles) must be approved by EFSA
  – There is no EU approval system for checking processes that recycle paper and card into a new FCM (e.g. pizza boxes) [nor in almost all Member States]

• Human health risks of chemicals in PICAB materials are largely unregulated
  – Not part of REACH Chemical Safety Reports & Authorisation
Some other problems

• Lack of overlap between REACH & FCM legislation
  – A chemical can be identified as a substance of very high concern (SVHC) in REACH, but creates no automatic action in FCM uses
  – Lack of an effective link between data gathered in REACH & FCM processes
    • See notes from a CHEM Trust workshop on REACH & FCM [3]

• Major scientific and technical challenges
  – NIAS: what is really coming out into the food?
  – Exposure to mixtures: the real world

• Enforcement
  – Is anyone checking the rules are being followed anyway?
  – Are cuts in public budgets making the situation even worse?
  – Lack of enforcement = rewarding those who don’t make an effort
Not a pretty picture

- The public would be very surprised by what is being talked about today
  - They expect the EU & governments to provide protection.
  - The fact that this area is not under control is a potential scandal in the future, even if it’s not visible at the moment
- Lack of regulation and investigation means we are only seeing the tip of the iceberg
- European Parliament passed a detailed report calling for improvements in October 2016 [6]
- Lots of resistance to action by Commission in recent years, but....
Signs of action...

- Promising comments from a Santé official quoted in Chemical Watch just before Christmas 2016 [7]:
  - “Mr Schupp said that DG Sante will evaluate the 40-year-old framework Regulation to see if it is “efficient and sustainable”, and will take “a close look at” which substances used in FCM are regulated.
  - He said there were approximately 10,000 substances used in FCMs, and it would take “one or two centuries” for the European Food Safety Authority to risk assess them all, as required under the current Regulation.”

- A detailed & very critical report from the Commission’s Joint Research Centre was published in January 2017 [8]

- Slides from a meeting with Member States on 30th January 2017 [9]:
Evaluation of FCM
- Backwards looking at 40 years of FCM legislation
- How well does the present legislation function?
- Focus on framework, but includes all legislation in force, including recycling and A&I
- Output: staff working document

printed FCM
- Forward looking
- Output: New Regulation

Why evaluate?
40 years old legislation, never evaluated

Doubts on correct functioning
- Non-harmonised
- Risk Assessment
- Information exchange in supply chain
- Difficulties with implementation and drafting of new legislation \(\Rightarrow\) e.g. how to risk assess 8000 substances

Very little concrete evidence
- JRC study provides clear evidence on non-harmonised
- Otherwise it is difficult to substantiate perceived problems
The CHEM Trust view

CHEM Trust briefing:
“Chemicals in food contact materials: A gap in the internal market, a failure in public protection”

Recommendations include:
- Harmonised regulations for chemicals in paper, card, inks, adhesives, coatings
- Action to substitute SVHCs and EDCs with safer alternatives
- Assessment of NIAS

http://www.chemtrust.org.uk/foodcontact/

http://www.chemtrust.org.uk
Conclusions

• **Not an acceptable situation**
  – From the point of view of public and most of the industry

• **We need protective, EU harmonised, regulation of all chemicals in Food Contact applications**
  – Including for recycled materials - EU law obliges recycling of packaging, but does not address chemical content

• **Commission is going to do something**
  – DG Santé do not have a good record…..

• **How to make sure the new approach is good enough?**
  – Particularly given DG Santé’s resistance to civil society!
References

http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=URISERV%3Al21082a


[3] Chemicals in food contact materials: notes from a workshop on regulatory gaps, CHEM Trust, 11th July 2016
http://www.chemtrust.org.uk/overlap-gaps-fcmlaws/

http://kemi.taenk.dk/bliv-groennere/test-unwanted-chemicals-found-pizza-boxes


[6] Laws regulating chemicals in food packaging are not good enough, European Parliament says, CHEM Trust, 6th October 2016
http://www.chemtrust.org.uk/meps-food-packaging/

[7] DG Sante promises action on food contact materials, Chemical Watch, 22nd Dec 2016
https://chemicalwatch.com/51859/dg-sante-promises-action-on-food-contact-materials

[8] Non-harmonised food contact materials in the EU: Regulatory and market situation: BASELINE STUDY, JRC, January 2017

[9] WG Food Contact Materials, 30th Jan 2017, DG Santé